

# Select Bibliography – Qualitative Evidence Synthesis

## Overviews

Barnett-Page, E & Thomas, J (2009) Methods for the synthesis of qualitative research: a critical review. NCRM Working Paper. NCRM. <http://eprints.ncrm.ac.uk/690/>

Barnett-Page E, Thomas J. Methods for the synthesis of qualitative research: a critical review. *BMC Med Res Methodol*. 2009 Aug 11;9:59. <http://www.biomedcentral.com/1471-2288/9/59>

Booth, A, Papaioannou, D & Sutton, A J (2011). *Systematic Approaches to a Successful Literature Review*. SAGE publications Ltd.

Dixon-Woods, M et al. (2004) Integrative approaches to qualitative and quantitative evidence. Health Development Agency, London, 44pp [http://www.nice.org.uk/niceMedia/pdf/Integrative\\_approaches\\_evidence.pdf](http://www.nice.org.uk/niceMedia/pdf/Integrative_approaches_evidence.pdf)

Dixon-Woods M, Bonas S, Booth A, Jones DR, Miller T, Shaw RL, Smith J, Sutton A, Young B: How can systematic reviews incorporate qualitative research? A critical perspective. *Qual Res* 2006, 6:27-44.

Dixon-Woods M, Agarwal S, Jones D, Young B, Sutton A (2005). Synthesising qualitative and quantitative evidence: a review of possible methods. *J Health Serv Res Pol*, 10(1):45-53

Downe S. (2008) Metasynthesis: a guide to knitting smoke. *Evidence Based Midwifery* 6(1): 4-8.

Gough, D, Oliver, S, Thomas, J (2012) *An Introduction to Systematic Reviews*. London: Sage Publications Ltd, 304 pages. ISBN: 9781849201810

Hannes, K. and Harden, A. (2011), Multi-context versus context-specific qualitative evidence syntheses: combining the best of both. *Res. Synth. Method*, 2: 271–278.

Hannes K and Lockwood C. *Synthesizing Qualitative Research: Choosing the Right Approach* John Wiley & Sons, Ltd, Chichester, UK.

Hannes, K. and Macaitis K (2012) A move to more systematic and transparent approaches in qualitative evidence synthesis: update on a review of published papers. *Qualitative Research* 12: 402-442

Hansen HP, Draborg E, Kristensen FB (2011). Exploring qualitative research synthesis: the role of patients' perspectives in health policy design and decision making. *Patient*. 4(3):143-52.

Lorenc, T; Pearson, M; Jamal, F; Cooper, C; Garside, R; (2012) The role of systematic reviews of qualitative evidence in evaluating interventions: a case study *Research Synthesis Methods*, 3 (1). 1-10.

Lucas P, Baird J, Arai L, Law C, Roberts H (2007) Worked examples of alternative methods for the synthesis of qualitative & quantitative research in systematic reviews. *BMC Medical Research Methodology* 4, 1-7.

Noyes J, Popay J, Pearson A, Hannes K, Booth A. Chapter 20: Qualitative research and Cochrane reviews. In: Higgins JPT, Green S (editors). *Cochrane Handbook for Systematic Reviews of Interventions*. Version 5.0.1 [updated September 2008]. The Cochrane Collaboration, 2008. Available from [www.cochrane-handbook.org](http://www.cochrane-handbook.org).  
[http://www.igh.org/Cochrane/tools/Ch20\\_Qualitative.pdf](http://www.igh.org/Cochrane/tools/Ch20_Qualitative.pdf)

Popay J, Roberts H, Sowden A et al. (2006) *Guidance on the Conduct of Narrative Synthesis in Systematic Reviews: a Product from the ESRC Methods Programme*.

Pope C, Mays N, & Popay J (2007) *Synthesizing Qualitative and Quantitative Health Evidence: a Guide to Methods*. Maidenhead: Open University Press

Paterson, B. L., Thorne, S. E., Canam, C., & Jillings, C. (2001). *Meta-study of qualitative health research*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.

Petticrew, M., & Roberts, H. (2006). *Systematic reviews in the social sciences: A practical guide*. Malden, MA: Blackwell.

Ring N, Jepson R, Ritchie K. Methods of synthesizing qualitative research studies for health technology assessment. *Int J Technol Assess Health Care*. 2011 Oct;27(4):384-90.

Saini, M. & Shlonsky, A (2012). *Systematic synthesis of qualitative research: A pocket guide for social work research methods*. Oxford University Press.

Sandelowski M, Barroso J (2007) *Handbook for Synthesizing Qualitative Research*. New York: Springer.

Webb C, Roe B. *Reviewing Research Evidence for Nursing Practice*. Oxford: Blackwell Publishing Ltd; 2007.

## **Bayesian Synthesis**

Crandell, J. L., Voils, C. I. and Sandelowski, M. (2011) Bayesian Approaches to the Synthesis of Qualitative and Quantitative Research Findings, in *Synthesizing Qualitative Research: Choosing the Right Approach* (eds K. Hannes and C. Lockwood), John Wiley & Sons, Ltd, Chichester, UK. doi: 10.1002/9781119959847.ch7

Crandell JL, Voils CI, Chang Y, Sandelowski M. Bayesian data augmentation methods for the synthesis of qualitative and quantitative research findings. *Qual Quant*. 2011 Apr;45(3):653-669

## **Critical Interpretive Synthesis**

Dixon-Woods M, Cavers D, Agarwal S, et al (2006) Conducting a critical interpretive synthesis of the literature on access to healthcare by vulnerable groups. *BMC Medical Research Methodology* 6(35).

Flemming K. Synthesis of quantitative and qualitative research: an example using Critical Interpretive Synthesis. *J Adv Nurs*. 2010 Jan;66(1):201-17.

Morrison LG, Yardley L, Powell J, Michie S. What design features are used in effective e-health interventions? A review using techniques from Critical Interpretive Synthesis. *Telemed J E Health*. 2012 Mar;18(2):137-44.

## **Framework Synthesis**

Carroll C, Booth A, Cooper K. A worked example of "best fit" framework synthesis: a systematic review of views concerning the taking of some potential chemopreventive agents. *BMC Med Res Methodol*. 2011 Mar 16;11:29.

Dixon-Woods M. Using framework-based synthesis for conducting reviews of qualitative studies. *BMC Med*. 2011 Apr 14;9:39.

## **Meta-ethnography**

Atkins S, et al. Conducting a meta-ethnography of qualitative literature: lessons learnt. *BMC Med Res Methodol*. 2008 Apr 16;8:21.

Britten, N et al (2002) Using meta ethnography to synthesise qualitative research: a worked example. *J.Hlth Serv Res & Policy*, 7(4) 209-15.

Campbell R, et al (2011). Evaluating meta-ethnography: systematic analysis and synthesis of qualitative research. *Health Technol Assess.* 15(43):1-164.

Malpass A, Shaw A, Sharp D, Walter F, Feder G, Ridd M, Kessler D (2009), 'Medication career' or 'Moral career'? The two sides of managing antidepressants: A meta-ethnography of patients' experience of antidepressants, *Social Science & Medicine*, 68, (1): 154-168.

Noblit, GW; Hare, R D (1988) *Meta-ethnography: synthesising qualitative studies* Sage: Thousand Oaks, CA, 1988. 88pp

### **Meta-Narrative Review**

Greenhalgh T, Robert G, Macfarlane F, Bate P, Kyriakidou O, Peacock R. Storylines of research in diffusion of innovation: a meta-narrative approach to systematic review. *Soc Sci Med.* 2005 Jul;61(2):417-30.

### **Meta-Synthesis**

O'Connell, R.; Downe, S. A metasynthesis of midwives' experience of hospital practice in publicly funded settings: Compliance, resistance and authenticity. *Health* 13; 6 (2009) 589-610.

Salter K, Hellings C, Foley N, Teasell R. J (2008). The experience of living with stroke: a qualitative meta-synthesis. *Rehabil Med.* 40(8):595-602.

### **Narrative Synthesis**

Arai L, Britten N, Popay J, Roberts H, Petticrew M, Rodgers M and Sowden A (2007) Testing methodological developments in the conduct of narrative synthesis: a demonstration review of research on the implementation of smoke alarm interventions, *Evidence & policy* 3, 361-83

Popay J, Roberts H Sowden A, Petticrew M, Arai L, Rodgers M, Britten N (2006) *Guidance on the conduct of narrative synthesis in systematic Reviews. A Product from the ESRC Methods Programme.* Version 1. Swindon: ESRC, 92 pages.

### **Realist Synthesis**

Pawson R et al (2005) Realist review--a new method of systematic review designed for complex policy interventions. *J Health Serv Res Policy.* 10 Suppl 1:21-34.

Pawson R *Evidence-Based Policy: A Realist Perspective* London, Sage, 2006

<http://www.leeds.ac.uk/sociology/realistsynthesis/>

Rycroft-Malone J, McCormack B, Hutchinson AM, Decorby K, Bucknall TK, Kent B, Schultz A, Snelgrove-Clarke E, Stetler CB, Titler M, Wallin L, Wilson V. Realist synthesis: illustrating the method for implementation research. *Implement Sci.* 2012 Apr 19;7(1):33. <http://www.implementationscience.com/content/7/1/33/abstract>

### **Thematic Synthesis**

Thomas J, & Harden A. Methods for the thematic synthesis of qualitative research in systematic reviews. *BMC Med Res Methodol.* 2008 Jul 10;8:45 <http://ukpmc.ac.uk/articlerender.cgi?artid=1593387>

## **Literature Searching**

- Barroso J, Gallup CJ, Sandelowski M, Meynell J, Pearce PF, Collins LJ: The challenge of searching for and retrieving qualitative studies. *Western Journal of Nursing Research* 2003, **25**:153-178.
- Bates, M. J. (1989). The design of browsing and berrypicking techniques for online search interface. *Online Review*, **13**, 407-424.
- Brunton G, Stansfield C, Thomas J (2012) In Gough, D, Oliver, S, Thomas, J (2012) *An Introduction to Systematic Reviews*. London: Sage Publications Ltd, 107-135.
- Cooke A, Smith D, Booth A (2012). Beyond PICO: The SPIDER Tool for Qualitative Evidence Synthesis. *Qual Health Res.* 22 (10): 1435 -1443.
- Flemming K, Briggs M. Electronic searching to locate qualitative research: evaluation of three strategies. *J Adv Nurs.* 2007 Jan;57(1):95-100.
- Gorecki CA, Brown JM, Briggs M, Nixon J. Evaluation of five search strategies in retrieving qualitative patient-reported electronic data on the impact of pressure ulcers on quality of life. *J Adv Nurs.* 2010 Mar;66(3):645-52.
- Greenhalgh T, Peacock R. Effectiveness and efficiency of search methods in systematic reviews of complex evidence: audit of primary sources. *BMJ.* 2005; 331(7524):1064-5.
- McKibbin KA, Wilczynski NL, Haynes RB. Developing optimal search strategies for retrieving qualitative studies in PsycINFO. *Eval Health Prof.* 2006 Dec;29(4):440-54.
- Papaioannou D, Sutton A, Carroll C, Booth A, Wong R. Literature searching for social science systematic reviews: consideration of a range of search techniques. *Health Info Libr J.* 2010 Jun;27(2):114-22
- Pearson M, Moxham T, Ashton K (2011). Effectiveness of Search Strategies for Qualitative Research About Barriers and Facilitators of Program Delivery. *Eval Health Prof.* 34(3):297-308..
- Shaw RL, Booth A, Sutton AJ et al (2004). Finding qualitative research: an evaluation of search strategies. *BMC Med Res Methodol.* 4(1):5.
- Stansfield C, Kavanagh J, Rees R, Gomersall A, Thomas J (2012) The selection of search sources influences the findings of a systematic review of people's views: a case study in public health. *BMC Med Res Methodol.* 12(1):55.
- Subirana M, Sola I, Garcia JM et al (2005). A nursing qualitative systematic review required MEDLINE and CINAHL for study identification. *J Clin Epidemiol.* 58(1):20-5
- Suri, H (2011) Purposeful Sampling in Qualitative Research Synthesis, *Qualitative Research Journal*, 11 (2): 63 – 75
- Walters LA, Wilczynski NL, Haynes RB; Hedges Team. Developing optimal search strategies for retrieving clinically relevant qualitative studies in EMBASE. *Qual Health Res.* 2006 Jan;16(1):162-8.
- Wilczynski NL, Marks S, Haynes RB. Search strategies for identifying qualitative studies in CINAHL. *Qual Health Res.* 2007 May;17(5):705-10.
- Wong SSL, Wilczynski NL, Haynes RB. Developing optimal search strategies for detecting clinically relevant qualitative studies in Medline. *Medinfo* 2004;311-314.

## Quality Assessment

- Attree, P & Milton, B (2006) Critically appraising qualitative research for systematic reviews: defusing the methodological cluster bombs. *Evidence & Policy: A Journal of Research, Debate and Practice*, 2 (1): 109-126.
- Barbour, RS (2000) Checklists for improving rigour in qualitative research: a case of the tail wagging the dog?, *Journal of Evaluation in Clinical Practice* 9 (2): 179–186.
- Boeije HR, van Wesel F, Alisic E (2011). Making a difference: towards a method for weighing the evidence in a qualitative synthesis. *J Eval Clin Pract.* 17(4):657-63.
- Carroll C, Booth A, Lloyd-Jones M (2012). Should We Exclude Inadequately Reported Studies From Qualitative Systematic Reviews? An Evaluation of Sensitivity Analyses in Two Case Study Reviews. *Qual Health Res.* Aug 3.
- Crowe M, Sheppard L (2011). A general critical appraisal tool: an evaluation of construct validity. *Int J Nurs Stud.* 48(12):1505-16. Epub 2011 Jul 30.
- Daly J et al (2007) A hierarchy of evidence for assessing qualitative health research. *J Clin Epidemiol.* 60(1):43-9. Epub 2006 Sep 28.
- Dixon-Woods, M. et al (2007) Appraising qualitative research for inclusion in systematic reviews: a quantitative and qualitative comparison of three methods *Journal of Health Services Research and Policy*, 12 (1): 42-47.
- Eakin, J & Mykhalovskiy, E (2003). Reframing the evaluation of qualitative research: Reflections on a review of assessment guidelines in the health sciences. *Journal of Evaluation in Clinical Practice*, 9(2), 187-194.
- Hannes K, Lockwood C, Pearson A (2010). A comparative analysis of three online appraisal instruments' ability to assess validity in qualitative research. *Qual Health Res.* 20(12):1736-43.
- Harden A, Gough D (2012) Quality and relevance appraisal. In Gough, D, Oliver, S, Thomas, J (2012) *An Introduction to Systematic Reviews*. London: Sage Publications Ltd, pages 153-179. ISBN: 9781849201810

## Synthesis

- Brunton G et al (2006). *A synthesis of research addressing children's, young people's and parents' views of walking and cycling for transport*. EPPI Centre; London.
- Dixon-Woods M, Booth A. & Sutton AJ (2007) Synthesizing qualitative research: a review of published reports *Qualitative Research*, Vol. 7, No. 3, 375-422
- Howell Major C and Savin-Baden M (2011) Integration of qualitative evidence: towards construction of academic knowledge in social science and professional fields *Qualitative Research* 11: 645-663,
- Huffman S. (2002). *Can Marketing Of Multiple Vitamin/Mineral Supplements Reach the Poor?* The Vitaldia Project, Bolivia.
- Miles M, & Huberman A. (1994). *Qualitative data analysis* (2nd ed.). Beverly Hills, CA: Sage.
- Newton BJ, et al. No Room for Reflexivity? Critical Reflections Following a Systematic Review of Qualitative Research. *J Health Psychol.* 2012 Jan 11. [Epub ahead of print]
- Oliver S et al (2008). A multidimensional conceptual framework for analysing public involvement in health services research. *Health Expectations* 11: 72-84.
- Oliver S et al. (2004). Involving consumers in the research and development agenda setting for the NHS: developing an evidence-based approach *Health Technology Assessment* 8(15).

Ritchie J, Spencer L (1994). Qualitative data analysis for applied policy research. In: Bryman A, Burgess RG, eds. *Analysing qualitative data*. London: Routledge: 173-94

Thomas J, Harden A, Newman M (2012) Synthesis: Combining results systematically and appropriately. In

Gough, D, Oliver, S, Thomas, J (2012) *An Introduction to Systematic Reviews*. London: Sage Publications Ltd, pages 179-227. ISBN: 9781849201810.

## ***Integration of Qual/Quan***

Candy B, King M, Jones L, Oliver S. Using qualitative synthesis to explore heterogeneity of complex interventions. *BMC Med Res Methodol*. 2011 Aug 26;11:124.

Cooper, B; Glaesser, J; Gomm, R & Hammersley, M (2012). *Challenging the qualitative-quantitative divide: Explorations in case-focused causal analysis*. London: Continuum Press.

Kavanagh, J., Campbell, F., Harden, A. and Thomas, J. (2011) Mixed Methods Synthesis: A Worked Example, in *Synthesizing Qualitative Research: Choosing the Right Approach* (eds K. Hannes and C. Lockwood), John Wiley & Sons, Ltd, Chichester, UK. doi: 10.1002/9781119959847.ch6

Leeman J et al (2011). A Mixed-Methods Approach to Synthesizing Evidence on Mediators of Intervention Effects *West J Nurs Res* 33: 870-900.

Maudsley G. Mixing it but not mixed-up: mixed methods research in medical education (a critical narrative review). *Med Teach*. 2011; 33(2):e92-104.

Pedersen VH, Dagenais P, Lehoux P. Multi-source synthesis of data to inform health policy. *Int J Technol Assess Health Care*. 2011 Jul;27(3):238-46.

Rosewilliam S, Roskell CA, Pandyan AD. A systematic review and synthesis of the quantitative and qualitative evidence behind patient-centred goal setting in stroke rehabilitation. *Clin Rehabil*. 2011 Jun;25(6):501-14.

Sandelowski M et al (2011). Mapping the Mixed Methods–Mixed Research Synthesis Terrain *Journal of Mixed Methods Research* 1558689811427913, first published on December 28, 2011 doi:10.1177/1558689811427913

Voils CI, Crandell JL, Chang Y, Leeman J, Sandelowski M. Combining adjusted and unadjusted findings in mixed research synthesis. *J Eval Clin Pract*. 2011 Jun;17(3):429-34.

## ***Reporting***

Booth A. "Brimful of STARLITE": toward standards for reporting literature searches. *J Med Libr Assoc*. 2006 Oct;94(4):421-9, e205.

Liberati A, Altman DG, Tetzlaff J, Mulrow C, Gøtzsche PC, et al. (2009) The PRISMA Statement for Reporting Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analyses of Studies That Evaluate Health Care Interventions: Explanation and Elaboration. *PLoS Med* 6(7): e1000100.

<http://www.plosmedicine.org/article/info:doi/10.1371/journal.pmed.1000100>

Moher D, Liberati A, Tetzlaff J, Altman DG, The PRISMA Group (2009). Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analyses: The PRISMA Statement. *PLoS Med* 6(6): e1000097.

Popay J., Rogers A. & Williams G. (1998) Rationale and standards for the systematic review of qualitative literature in health services research. *Qualitative Health Research* 8(3), 341–351.